

## **COUNCIL, Wednesday, 27th July, 2022**

**PRESENT:**

The Worshipful the Mayor (Councillor Gallagher) in the Chair

---

Atkinson	Evans	Prashad
Baker	Fazal	Rivron
Barnes	Fenton-Glynn	Robinson
Beech	Ford	Scullion
Bellenger	Foster	Shoukat
Benton	Hey	A Smith
Blagbrough	Holdsworth	Sutherland
Brundell	Hutchinson	T Swift MBE
Caffrey	Kirton	Taylor
Cairney	Leigh MBE	Thompson
Cavanagh	Lynn	Thornber
Clarke	Monteith	Tremayne
Courtney	Parsons-Hulse	Whittaker
Dacre	Patient	Wilkinson
Dickenson	Pillai	Young
Durrans	Porritt	

**19 MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL MEETING HELD ON 18TH MAY 2022 TO BE AGREED AS A CORRECT RECORD AND SIGNED BY THE MAYOR.**

It was moved by the Mayor,  
Seconded by Deputy Mayor, and

**RESOLVED** that the Minutes of the meeting of the Council held on 18<sup>th</sup> May 2022, having been printed and a copy sent to each Member of the Council, be taken as read and signed by the Mayor.

**20 MEMBERS' INTERESTS**

The Mayor reminded Members of the need to declare any disclosable pecuniary interests or other interests which they might have in relation to the items to be considered at the Council meeting.

**21 TO RECEIVE THE MAYOR'S OR CHIEF EXECUTIVE'S ANNOUNCEMENTS (IF ANY)**

The Chief Executive paid tribute to Iain Baines, Director, Adult Services and Wellbeing, who was retiring after 39 years working in Social Care. He described Iain as having compassion, kindness, and consideration for others, who in the testing time of the past 2 years had made decisions to put Calderdale's residents first and save people's lives. Iain had had a critical influence on the Social Care system during his time with Calderdale Council. The Chief Executive announced that a substantive Director had been recruited to begin in October and an interim Director would be acting until that time.

Councillor Blagbrough paid tribute to Iain Baines as Chair of the Adults, Health and Social Care Scrutiny Board. He described Iain as dedicated, hardworking, conscientious, honest, and realistic about improvements to the Service. He thanked Iain for his dedication to Calderdale Council and added that he would greatly be missed.

Councillor Fenton-Glynn paid tribute to Iain Baines as Cabinet Member with responsibility for Adult Services and Wellbeing. He described Iain as a font of all knowledge with the ability to react to events and to not lose sight of the direction for the Service. He credited Iain as being essential to the achievements of the Service, and that they would continue to build upon his legacy of inclusive and integrated services.

Councillor Foster paid tribute to Iain on behalf of the office of Holly Lynch MP. She advised that Iain had been hugely helpful on advising and assisting with resolving casework received by the office.

**22 TO RECEIVE PETITIONS, IF ANY, PRESENTED BY MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL.**

- (A) Councillor Shoukat presented a petition on behalf of the residents of Skircoat and Park Wards regarding the proposal of a cycle lane on King Cross Street (A58).

The Mayor confirmed that the petition would be dealt with in accordance with the provisions of the Council's Petitions Scheme.

**23 TO ANSWER QUESTIONS ASKED BY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC UNDER COUNCIL PROCEDURE RULE 12.**

- (A) **Question from Nikki Kelly to Councillor Lynn, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Public Services and Communities.**

"On 8th July 2022, Calderdale Council's Environmental Health Team received a report from a private contractor with their findings regarding the 'Holmfield Hum'. To date, the findings have not been shared with residents, and no further action has been taken. The situation has been ongoing for an extensive period and has severely affected the mental health of residents. Please can an update be provided, and what actions are to be taken in addressing the 'Holmfield Hum'?"

In response, Councillor Lynn advised:

"The noise complaint referred to as the "Holmfield Hum" is both a long standing and complex case. The investigating officers firmly believe that they are dealing with more than one noise from more than one source. In addition there is also the added layer of complexity due to the topography and the make-up of the locality which is a mixed residential/commercial urban environment.

Another significant challenge facing officers in this case is the fact that the noises being complained of are not audible to all. Extensive efforts to identify the noises, and hear/detect them, have been made since the matter was first reported.

At this time Council Officers have no evidence of a statutory noise nuisance but we do recognise that the noise being heard by some residents is impacting on the well-being of those individuals. Extensive enquiries into the noise complaints have been undertaken and officers now believe that they have exhausted all reasonable lines of enquiry to resolve the issue however, given the clear impact on some residents they want to be reassured that their conclusion is robust and based on best evidence. To that end Officers have asked for their findings and subsequent conclusion to be tested by an independent noise consultant.

You are quite correct that the Council received a report on 8<sup>th</sup> July 2022 from the noise consultant however, that report needed to be analysed by officers who also had follow up meetings with the consultant so as to be clear in respect to the findings. This is an important step as it will clearly drive what happens next.

Throughout this whole process complainants, ward members and the local MP have been kept updated on progress made and reassured that they will be first to know what the Council intends to do next.

I have been reassured by officers that the findings will be shared with the complainants, ward members for Illingworth & Mixenden and Holly Lynch, MP no later than 12<sup>th</sup> August 2022. At that time officers will outline what action they intend to take next.

In respect to making our findings public the Council can only do this when it is confident that the investigation has been concluded and there is no likelihood that information disclosed would compromise any present or future investigation. However, the Council is committed to being transparent and will when appropriate be open with our findings and action to date."

**(B) Question from Peter Hunt to Councillor Lynn, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Public Services and Communities.**

"What provision is there for residents of advanced age and / or disability who are expected to carry their waste and recycling some distance from their homes to the edge of the nearest highway ? In view of the fact that age and disability are protected characteristics under the Equality Act 2010?"

In response, Councillor Lynn advised:

"We offer an Assisted Collection service for residents who struggle to get their Waste and Recycling containers to the collection points providing certain criteria are met.

Permanent and Temporary applications are available. In both cases, an online application form must be completed or alternatively this can be done via a phone call to our Contact Centre. Proof of details of their circumstances may be requested.

**Permanent** help with taking wheeled bins / Recycling Receptacles to the required collection point can be given to households where there is no able bodied person (15 years old or over) living at the property and all residents are:

- 75 years old or over, **or**
- Holders of a Blue Badge entitling them to parking concessions, **or**
- In receipt of the Mobility Component of the Enhanced Mobility component of the Personal Independence Payment, **or**
- In receipt of Higher Rate of Care Component of Enhanced Daily Living component of Personal Independence Payment, **or**
- Registered Blind or Partially Sighted,

and there is no other able bodied adult, including neighbours / carer who can help.

Permanent applications will be reviewed regularly.

**Temporary** help may be given to Households where there is a need, for example following a stay in hospital and there is no other person available to move the Receptacles. This is limited to three months, but then a further application for help can be made."

**(C) Question from Penny Hutchinson to Councillor Scullion, Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member with responsibility for Regeneration and Strategy.**

“With local/national drives to encourage exercise, our Swimming Pool and Leisure Centre have been closed since the Covid-19 pandemic began. Had they been maintained; they could have remained open until a replacement was ready. Noting, the swimming pool will not accommodate all the groups the closed one did, I on behalf of Calderdale residents, want to know when we will have a swimming pool and leisure centre in Halifax. What is the date for the new facilities to open? Can the funds saved from running the old facilities be redirected to subsidise those having to travel afar to swim/leisure facilities?”

In response, Councillor Scullion advised:

“The Delivery of the new Leisure Centre project is progressing and is anticipated to open in early 2024.

Any funds saved from the closure of both Halifax Pool and Northbridge Leisure Centre are assisting with current service overspend.”

**24 ANNUAL SCRUTINY REPORT 2020/22**

Councillor Blagbrough presented a written report of the Senior Scrutiny Officer. The report advised that the Scrutiny Board Chairs and Deputy Chairs had agreed to prepare an Annual report for Council when they met on 31 March 2022. The report covered two years, April 2020 until March 2022, covering the period from the start of the Covid-19 pandemic, and gave examples of the work undertaken by each of Council’s four Scrutiny Boards, particularly highlighting detailed reviews.

The report advised that Scrutiny Board meetings were suspended in March 2020 but were held virtually via Zoom from June 2020. The report provided examples of the topics which had been covered at Scrutiny Board meetings during the given time period, and provided information about the detailed reviews, each of which looked at a topic in more depth.

In addition to the report, Councillor Blagbrough advised that Scrutiny had been effective during the pandemic. He advised that it was a success of the Council that all Members and Officers were able to participate in online meetings and considered that although in-person meetings would be used on occasion, remote Scrutiny would remain a part of Calderdale Council forever. He advised that Scrutiny had provided a valuable examination of the response to Covid-19 and seen tangible improvements in the way Calderdale residents were supported. He thanked Officers and guests for attending the meetings and answering Scrutiny questions.

**25 TO CONSIDER THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF AUDIT COMMITTEE ON THE FOLLOWING MATTERS:**

It was moved by Councillor Leigh MBE,  
Seconded by Councillor Scullion,

that the recommendation of the Audit Committee contained in Minute Number 4 be approved.

**RESOLVED** that Councillor Bellenger be appointed as Deputy Chair of the Audit Committee for the 2022/2023 Municipal Year.

It was moved by Councillor Leigh MBE,  
Seconded by Councillor Scullion,

that the recommendation of the Audit Committee contained in Minute Number 7 be approved.

**RESOLVED** that the 2021-22 Audit Committee Annual Report be received.

**26 TO CONSIDER THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF STANDARDS COMMITTEE ON THE FOLLOWING MATTERS:**

It was moved by Councillor Blagbrough,  
Seconded by Councillor T Swift MBE,

that the recommendation of the Standards Committee contained in Minute Number 3 be approved.

**RESOLVED** that Councillor Scullion be appointed Deputy Chair and the Councillor to move recommendations of the Standards Committee at Council meetings for the 2022/2023 Municipal Year.

It was moved by Councillor Blagbrough,  
Seconded by Councillor Scullion,

that the recommendation of the Standards Committee contained in Minute Number 5 be approved.

**RESOLVED** that:

(a) appointments of Co-opted Members Canon Hilary Barber, Andrew Johnson, Parish Councillor Val Stevens and Kathy Beevers, Paul Beevers, as Independent Members of the Standards Committee be extended for the remainder of the 2022/23 Municipal Year; and

(b) three vacancies of Independent Persons or Co-opted Members of the Standards Committee be appointed to.

**27 TO CONSIDER THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF HEALTH AND WELLBEING BOARD ON THE FOLLOWING MATTERS:**

It was moved by Councillor T Swift MBE,  
Seconded by Councillor Fenton-Glynn,

that the recommendation of the Health and Wellbeing Board contained in Minute Number 5 be approved.

**RESOLVED** that:

- (a) the revised Terms of Reference and Procedure Rules set out in Appendix 1 of the report be adopted; and
- (b) the membership of the Health and Wellbeing Board be changed as set out in Appendix 2 of the report, subject to an amendment to appoint two Members of the Clinical and Professional Forum.

**28 TO RECEIVE A REPORT FROM THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL ON THE WORK OF THE WEST YORKSHIRE COMBINED AUTHORITY.**

The Leader, Councillor T Swift MBE submitted a written report that provided Members with an update on the work of the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA). The report advised that The UK Shared Prosperity Fund (UKSPF) Local Partnership Group had been established to advise West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) on the development and endorsement of the Local Investment Plans for both UKSPF and Multiply, and the subsequent development and delivery of the programmes. An MP engagement group had also been established for UKSPF and Multiply.

The report provided background information on Development and Delivery and Climate, Energy and Environment.

**29 TO RECEIVE REPORTS FROM THE LEADER AND CABINET MEMBERS ON THE DISCHARGE OF THEIR ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES SINCE THE LAST MEETING OF THE COUNCIL:**

**(A) LEADER'S REPORT TO COUNCIL**

The Leader, Councillor T Swift MBE, submitted a written report on the work he had carried out since the last meeting of the Council. The Leader noted that Cabinet had met twice since the Annual Council Meeting, and that the July Cabinet meeting had taken two really important decisions. The first was to agree the Major Modifications to the Local Plan to go out to consultation- a significant step forward in moving towards having an adopted plan that shaped future development and helped deliver on the ambitions for Calderdale; the second was agreement to proposals to raise the pay levels of social care staff to the Living Wage, providing dignity and recognition to an important and under-valued workforce and improving care by boosting recruitment and retention.

The report outlined other important decisions which were:

- Agreeing proposals to reshape our partnership work around Climate Change with the creation of the Climate Change Partnership;
- Approving the Highways Capital programme which included an increase in allocation for maintenance schemes and additional investment in white lining;

- Starting consultation on restructuring within Public Health and CAFM service areas;
- Accepting a report from the Place Scrutiny Panel on the Planning Service improvement plan;
- Receiving the annual report on fire safety and agreeing an updated Fire Safety Action Plan; and
- Receiving annual performance report and final accounts.

The report identified and provided background information on Priorities and Plans, the Health and Wellbeing Board, West Yorkshire Health Partnership work, Re-Stitch Conference, and We Are Calderdale.

In addition to the report the Leader announced that he endorsed the comments made about Iain Baines under Item 3. The Leader advised Members of a recent serious fire in Ovenden, where 4 members of the public had acted very quickly and bravely, protecting residents and preventing loss of life. He intended to write to the Fire Authority to consider appropriate reward and recognition.

## **(B) CABINET MEMBER REPORTS**

### **(i) Deputy Leader and Regeneration and Strategy**

Councillor Scullion, Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Regeneration and Strategy, submitted a written report on the work she had carried out since the last meeting of the Council. She confirmed that the Major Projects Service had continued to deliver the capital portfolio at pace and in line with funding criteria.

Key issues being managed were high levels of inflation in the construction industry and the challenge of recruiting qualified and experienced project management and technical staff.

The report detailed the work on the following projects:

- A641 Multi-modal Transportation scheme
- Clifton Enterprise Zone scheme
- Brighouse Town Deal Scheme
- Ryburn Valley High School
- Ash Green Primary
- Ravenscliffe@Spring Hall
- A629 Phases 1b and 2
- Halifax Station Gateway
- Northgate Commercial Development
- Mixenden Hub
- Halifax Leisure Centre
- Elland Town Future High Street Fund
- Halifax Future High Street Fund

The report provided further background information on Planning and Building Control, Strategic Infrastructure, Inclusive Economy, Business, and Visitor Economy.

### **(ii) Adult Services and Wellbeing**



Councillor Fenton-Glynn, Cabinet Member for Adult Services and Wellbeing, submitted a written report on the work he had carried out since the last meeting of the Council. He advised that the Director of Adult Services and Wellbeing, Iain Baines, was retiring that week. In retiring he brought to an end a career in social care that started at 17 as a care home assistant. His time in Calderdale had seen our service rise through the rankings to be one of the best in the country. He had guided Calderdale through Covid and continued pressures on recovery. From keeping control of the largest budget in the Council, to understanding the ever-shifting regulatory environment that framed social care, this council was stronger because of Iain's dedication and talent.

The report identified and provided background information on Charging Reform, Pay for Care Staff, Visiting Our Services, Recruitment, Dementia Centre of Excellence, Buildings, Commissioning, and Responding to the Care Quality Commission (CQC).

In addition to the report Councillor Fenton-Glynn commented on extra support being discussed for care workers and a revision of fuel imbursements in light of the rising price of fuel, to ensure care workers were being properly paid for mileage.

### **(iii) Children and Young People's Services**

Councillor Wilkinson, Cabinet Member for Children and Young People's Services, submitted a written report on the work he had carried out since the last Council meeting.

The report identified and provided background information on Early Years, School Effectiveness Service, Mental Health and Wellbeing, Inclusion, School Place Planning, Ash Green Community Primary School, Schools Rebuilding Programme, Special Educational Needs and Disability (SEND), School Attendance, and School Admissions.

### **(iv) Climate Change and Resilience**

Councillor Patient, Cabinet Member for Climate Change and Resilience, submitted a written report on the work he had carried out since the last Council meeting. He advised that this Council report was especially prescient given the recent blistering heatwave which caused deaths and countless stresses to services. Events like these were becoming more common and severe given continued investment into fossil fuels by Governments like ours.

The report advised that Councillor Patient was pleased to have spoken at the recent Halifax Civic Trust AGM about what we were doing as a borough to decarbonise our buildings and he had had a few discussions since about how we could help the Trust get more involved in this work.

The report advised that the Slow the Flow Climate roadshow had recently opened at the Halifax Central Library and events were ongoing over the summer; the second cohort of Green Futures students had graduated from Todmorden Climate College; and the UK's first ever E-bike festival had taken place in Mytholmroyd at the bottom of England's Longest Gradual Incline, Cragg Vale, which saw many visitors try out E bikes and E Cargo bikes.

The report identified and provided background information on Housing, Green Economy, and Voluntary and Community Sector.

**(v) Public Services and Communities**

Councillor Lynn, Cabinet Member for Public Services and Communities, submitted a written report on the work she had carried out since the last meeting of the Council. She advised that Calderdale was no exception to the Covid infection rates on the rise right across the country and offered thanks to all the staff in Public Services and Communities for being so resilient and doing their very best to keep the show on the road, even when absence levels had been going up.

The report identified and provided background information on Bereavement Services, Waste and Recycling, Green Spaces and Street Scene, Transport Services, Parking Services, Community Protection Team, Sports Services, Customer Access, Neighbourhoods and Cohesion, Welfare and Benefits Team, and Cultural Services.

**(vi) Resources**

Councillor Dacre, Cabinet Member for Resources submitted a written report on the work she had undertaken since the last meeting of Council.

The report identified and provided background information on Employment and Skills, Corporate and Facilities Management (CAFM), Markets, ICT Infrastructure, Digital Transformation and Strategy, Performance Management, Transformation and Business Intelligence, Finance, and Human Resources and Organisational Development.

In addition to the report, Councillor Dacre advised that Cyber Security Training was due for completion and it was crucial this be completed in a timely fashion.

**(vii) Towns, Engagement and Public Health**

Councillor Courtney, Cabinet Member for Towns, Engagement and Public Health, submitted a written report on the work she had carried out since her appointment at Annual Council. She advised that working in Cabinet overseeing Public Health priorities and the vision for Calderdale's vibrant towns was really exciting. Working towards the aspiration to put Calderdale on the map as the place to be for heritage, arts, and music, and to make Calderdale the small business capital of the North, would also help the health of people visiting, living, and working in these communities. If our towns were attractive and people felt safe, they could live larger, more active lives, and participating in active travel had the added advantage of helping to tackle climate change and improve air quality.

The report identified and provided background information on Towns, Engagement and Public Health.

Following the delivery of the Cabinet Member reports Members asked the following questions:

- Councillor Evans advised that there was a national increase in school absences which had been exacerbated by the pandemic, with tens of thousands of children persistently or severely absent. He asked what was

being done to address this. In response, Councillor Wilkinson advised that home schooling had increased in Calderdale as nationally, which did raise safeguarding concerns. He advised that a recent report to Cabinet had addressed the dip in attendance particularly in secondary schools, which was partly down to how records were taken during the pandemic and was being monitored to see if the trend continued. He advised that a full written response would be provided.

- Councillor Baker asked whether hotspots could be considered, rather than a blanket ban on public drinking, in the Public Space Protection Order. In response, Councillor Lynn advised that the intention was to give Officers the opportunity to intervene where alcohol may be a precursor to anti-social behaviour and should not be seen as a blanket ban of alcohol.
- Councillor Tremayne asked for an update on the Meningitis cases in Todmorden. In response, Councillor Courtney advised that there had been a small break out of a rare strain of Meningitis B. There had been around 50% uptake of the first vaccination dose, with the second doses due to be given that week. Councillor Courtney thanked the family of a young man who died during the outbreak for their bravery in sharing their story.
- Councillor Parsons-Hulse asked that Cabinet reconsider resurfacing Doctor Hill. In response, Councillor Scullion advised that although this had not been included in this year's Capital Programme based on road condition, it was possible for things to change depending on circumstances and this would be looked at again.
- Councillor Blagbrough paid tribute to Harry Gration who was supportive of Yorkshire's local towns. Councillor Blagbrough commented that the Brighouse library and art gallery were amazing buildings and underutilised. He asked what progress was being made to commercialise these buildings and asked for an update on the progress of Brighouse Civic Hall. In response, Councillor Scullion thanked Councillor Blagbrough for the tribute to Harry Gration. Councillor Scullion advised that a number of items were being looked at but that a community was more than its buildings and the responsibility was to invest in all kinds of ways. She advised that a full written response would be provided.
- Councillor Barnes commented on the poor public transport service between Calderdale and Huddersfield hospitals, and he urged Councillor T Swift MBE to join the Skircoat Ward Councillors in requesting the Hospital Trust extend the shuttle service to cater for patients as well as staff. In response, Councillor T Swift MBE agreed that there was a need for a connected service and advised that he would raise this with the West Yorkshire Mayor to see what pressure could be applied.
- Councillor Bellenger asked what was being done to reduce the waiting times for the Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services (CAHMS) and how children who were waiting were being supported, as it was unfair and unacceptable for children to wait so long for help and support. In response, Councillor T Swift MBE advised that good progress was being made prior to the Covid-19 pandemic but that national reports highlighted that the demand

for children's mental health services was growing and would continue to grow. He advised that work with partners would continue to offer support to those waiting but that this depended on the availability of trained professionals. Councillor Wilkinson advised that particularly good progress had been made in reducing the waiting list and providing support while waiting for children with Autism and Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), but unfortunately this had gone backwards as a result of the pandemic. He advised that extra mental health support was being provided in schools and there were plans to grow this support.

- Councillor Whittaker asked why Birds Royd Lane was being considered for speed bumps after the Council recognised the need for the road to be fully reconstructed. In response, Councillor Scullion advised that the speedbumps were important in stopping the road from becoming worse, while it was being used in the interim. She advised that a full written response would be provided.
- Councillor Kirton asked when weed treatments for hard services would be applied to public areas, and why it was not done during the recent dry period. In response, Councillor Lynn advised that this was usually done in spring and she would enquire with Officers as to why this had not been done.
- Councillor Hutchinson asked what Charging Reform would mean for Calderdale, the Social Care Department, and the legion of unpaid carers in the borough. In response, Councillor Fenton-Glynn advised that although Charging Reform did solve some problems it did not go far enough towards solving the problems in social care. He advised that Charging Reform capped the amount people paid for care, but that care work needed to be recognised as skilled work.
- Councillor Ford asked why the contract for the A629 Calder and Hebble Junction was given to an overseas company. He added that he had been impressed by the work done by the contractor and this was not a criticism of their work. He further asked what the plans were for the promenade. In response, Councillor Scullion advised that the contractor had won a competitive tendering process and the details of this process could be provided. She advised that the Ward Councillors for Skircoat and Elland had been kept well informed. She advised that work was being done with the contractor to retain as much of the promenade as possible, putting it to use in a way that met the heritage.
- Councillor Foster raised concerns about potential loss of condemned play equipment. She asked what was being done to secure funding for replacements. In response, Councillor Lynn advised that there was a regular programme each year for refurbishment and replacement of play equipment. She advised that the intention was to seek to replace, but there was no guarantee to replace every piece of equipment like for like.
- Councillor Caffrey commented on the wait times and abandonment rate for Customer First and asked what the causes for these were. In response, Councillor Lynn advised that more customers were choosing to interact online and this in part accounted for the abandonment rate. The triage arrangement

for prioritising calls coming in enabled staff to spend more time where it was needed, and to take the opportunity to offer face to face help when appropriate.

- Councillor Pillai asked why the speedbumps in Woodhouse were too small, leading to a delay and further cost. In response, Councillor Scullion advised that a full written response would be provided.
- Councillor Dickenson asked if there would be a shortage of water following a dry spell of 6 months with below average rainfall, as no new reservoirs had been built in Calderdale since the 1970s. In response, Councillor Scullion advised that there had been discussions around building a new reservoir, this had not been ruled out but alternative measures were being considered. Climate Change meant looking at new ideas for managing water as the borough lurched between flood and drought, Calderdale Council was working with Yorkshire Water, the Environment Agency, and others on resilience plans.
- Councillor Baker asked what support was being put in place for adults in the upper valley when the Healthy Minds Support Service ended. In response, Councillor Patient advised that discussions were ongoing with Healthy Minds to source further funding, support would be continuing within the Flood Action Plan.

**30 TO APPOINT MEMBERS AND SUBSTITUTE MEMBERS (AS NECESSARY) TO SERVE ON SCRUTINY BOARDS/PANELS AND COUNCIL COMMITTEES.**

**RESOLVED** that Members of the Council and others be appointed to serve as representatives of the Council on outside bodies unless they resign, become disqualified or are replaced by resolution of the Council as follows:

<b>Place Scrutiny Board</b>	Delete Councillor Robinson as a Member and Replace with Councillor Caffrey.  Appoint Councillor Dickenson as Chair of the Place Scrutiny Board
<b>Strategy and Performance Board and Scrutiny Board</b>	Delete Councillor Caffrey as a Member and Replace with Councillor Robinson.  Delete Councillor Robinson as a Substitute.  Appoint Councillor Robinson as Chair of the Strategy and Performance Scrutiny Board
<b>Audit Committee</b>	Delete Councillor Barnes as a member and replace with Councillor Cavanagh.
<b>Governance and Business Committee</b>	Appoint Councillor Durrans as a Substitute.

**31 TO APPOINT REPRESENTATIVES (AS NECESSARY) TO SERVE ON OUTSIDE BODIES.**

**RESOLVED** that the following Members of the Council and others be appointed to serve as representatives of the Council on outside bodies unless they resign, become disqualified or are replaced by resolution of the Council as follows:

<b>Brighthouse War Memorial (Nurses Endowment) Fund</b>	<p>Councillor Blagbrough Councillor T Benton Councillor Kirton Councillor Pillai Councillor Whittaker Councillor Monteith Mrs C Blagbrough Mr M Blagbrough Ms P Fellows Mr C Hopkinson Mr O Willows Ms C Kirk Scott Benton Fr Paul Webb Revd Michelle Petch Rachel Dilly Sue Radcliffe John Radcliffe</p> <p>Be appointed as Trustees for a one year term of office expiring in July 2023.</p>
---	--

**32 TO ANSWER QUESTIONS ASKED BY MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL UNDER COUNCIL PROCEDURE RULE 13.**

**(A) Question from Councillor Taylor to Councillor Scullion, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Regeneration and Strategy:**

“At Full Council on 23 March 2022, I raised the issue of the totally inadequate public conveniences in Halifax town centre, especially with the closure of the facilities in the bus station. Since then, absolutely nothing has altered and, as I daily walk into the town centre, there are more people visiting/using the centre in the summer weather. Daily I witness queues outside the small Albion Street toilets which, in my opinion, is totally unacceptable. Visitors, unless specifically visiting the Piece Hall, are unaware of their conveniences. What, if anything, has been discussed with council officers, WY Metro and maybe bus operating companies since the last Full Council?”

In response, Councillor Scullion advised:

**Wednesday, 27th July, 2022**

“The Council has an on-going dialogue with the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) on this matter and have discussed the points raised with WYCA officers responsible for the delivery of the Bus Station project. Unfortunately, it is not possible to provide safe and accessible temporary toilet facilities at the bus station site during the works. As you will know, the temporary bus station facilities are on a constrained site, and other bus stops are distributed to locations in other areas of the Town Centre.

Other locations have been considered for temporary facilities but have been ruled out for logistical and safety reasons.

As asset owner of Halifax Bus Station, WYCA has highlighted that they have received very few complaints on this issue from members of the public since the latest construction phase began in late February 2022. It is understood from dialogue with the bus station management team that many members of the public appear to be using alternative toilets situated in either public or private premises around Halifax town centre before or after their bus journeys from the temporary bus station. Our Officers will continue to raise this matter with WYCA and will work jointly to address these concerns.”

**(B) Question from Councillor Taylor to Councillor Scullion, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Regeneration and Strategy:**

“With the closure of the Halifax bus station buses are terminating (apart from those using North Bridge) all over the centre. A number of TeamPENNINE (formerly Tiger Bus) services are using Wards End for this purpose. The bus stop caters for two buses only and sometimes there can be three, or even four waiting their timetable slot before leaving. This can cause congestion at the top of Wards End and is not ideal. As a short-term measure to assist them with space, would it not be an idea to temporarily remove the two blue badge bays and replace with a temporary bus stop for the duration of the bus station works? As I am in the town centre almost daily, and all our centres will be the same, I notice that post lockdowns and working from home, there are plenty of available spaces for blue badge holders to use in the meantime.”

In response, Councillor Scullion advised:

“The provision of disabled bays is intended to ensure that no disabled person is disadvantaged by having to travel further than they reasonably have to. Thus, the fact that there may currently be under used parking bays should not be taken to imply that the removal of some of the bays would not have a detrimental impact.

However, I will ask my officers to liaise with their WYCA counterparts in order to investigate Cllr Taylor’s suggestion further.”

**(C) Question from Councillor Leigh MBE to Councillor Patient, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Climate Change and Resilience:**

“Does the Cabinet Member for Climate Change and Resilience stand by his comments made at the Cabinet Meeting held on Monday 6 June 2022 that the Department for Food, Environment and Rural Affairs (DEFRA) would challenge

Calderdale Council if it declared an Air Quality Management Area in West Vale because it currently does not exceed the target for national air quality objectives? Does the Cabinet Member also stand by his comments, that West Vale cannot be projected to exceed national air quality objectives in coming years, despite West Vale nearly exceeding air quality objectives prior to the Covid-19 pandemic?"

In response, Councillor Patient advised:

"The Council Member for Climate Change and Resilience maintains that the Council currently has no evidence to suggest that the national air quality objectives will be exceeded for West Vale in the coming years. Evidence used to formulate this statement is based on the available air quality monitoring levels recorded for that locality and national strategic direction such as the increasing use of electric vehicles on the road network and the move to renewable energies. Of course, levels will continue to be monitored and reviewed.

If a local authority finds any places where the objectives are not likely to be achieved, it must declare an Air Quality Management Area (AQMA). This area could be just one or two streets, or it could be much bigger. In response the local authority will pull together a plan to improve the air quality - a Local Air Quality Action Plan and undertake public consultation. Officers are not aware of a case of an Air Quality Management Area being declared without the necessary level of evidence and are unsure if there is a legitimacy to do so. Officers would fully expect the Secretary of State for Environment to question the Council about the introduction of an Air Quality Management Area should one be introduced without the necessary evidence."

**(D) Question from Councillor Beech to Councillor Scullion, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Regeneration and Strategy:**

"Once again, the Mixenden Hub has been delayed. The promised Hub has been discussed for over a decade and appears in the Labour's Party's election literature every year, assuring residents that work is finally about to begin. The proposed Hub which was promised all those years ago has been stripped of its original promised facilities including a post office, free cash withdrawals and a retail unit. Will the Cabinet apologise to residents in Mixenden on the continued delays to the scheme, and tell us when it will be built, and what it will actually provide?"

In response, Councillor Scullion advised:

"I can confirm that Cabinet is in receipt of a paper regarding the Mixenden Hub development which will be discussed at the next Cabinet Meeting. The project was progressing as planned with construction contractors invited to tender, unfortunately the key tenant withdrew their interest from the project. Officers have worked jointly with colleagues at the ICB (formally CCG) to secure another tenant for the scheme and community and the report provides Cabinet with an update and next steps with regard to this."

**(E) Question from Councillor Caffrey to Councillor Scullion, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Regeneration and Strategy:**



“Under the current draft of the Local Plan, Northowram and Shelf is scheduled for up to 1000 additional houses. The area lacks shops, services, or amenities, it has no bus or railway stations, no post office, and under the Future Council Programme – less libraries. The current draft Plan lacks any new employment allocations nor infrastructure developments. This will lead to greater car use, congestion and carbon emissions, particularly concentrated at Stump Cross which is an Air Quality Management Area. Will the Council review the spatial distribution of the housing allocation to relieve pressure on areas lacking adequate infrastructure?”

In response, Councillor Scullion advised:

“The spatial distribution of development has been subject to Sustainability Appraisal as part of the plan-making process. This matter was subsequently discussed in depth at Local Plan Examination hearings where all parties had an opportunity to present their arguments to the independently appointed Inspector. We believe that the spatial distribution is sustainable, and the Inspector has confirmed that *“subject to main modifications, the Plan is likely to be capable of being found legally compliant and sound”*; however, this issue will ultimately be resolved through the Inspector’s report after the Main Modifications consultation.”

**(F) Question from Councillor Pillai to Councillor Scullion, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Regeneration and Strategy:**

“Roads in Rastrick are set to be heavily impacted by the huge number of houses allocated in the draft Local Plan. Ahead of the planned Local Plan modifications consultation, please will the Cabinet publish adequate mapping of traffic growth on the local highway network over the Local Plan period? This data will be essential in considering the potential adverse impacts of the spatial distribution of the housing allocation, and consequential changes to carbon emissions and air quality and will be essential viewing before any Local Plan Modifications consultation.”

In response, Councillor Scullion advised:

“The Council has prepared a transport evidence base that we consider meets the requirements of national planning policy. This evidence provides a realistic assessment of the impact of the Local Plan on delays and congestion. The Council has also detailed the mitigation measures that will be required within the evidence base. This Council’s evidence was considered alongside that submitted by other interested parties at the Local Plan Examination hearings, and the Planning Inspector is not now seeking further transport related information. Finally, the Inspector has confirmed to the Council that *“subject to main modifications, the Plan is likely to be capable of being found legally compliant and sound”*.”

**(G) Question from Councillor Prashad to Councillor Lynn, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Public Services and Communities:**

"The Council was slow to respond to a recent surge in graffiti and tagging on both Council and private property in the Greetland and Stainland ward, leading to me having to remove graffiti myself.

Would the Council consider issuing graffiti removing kits to members, as has been done to great effect by York Council as the speedy removal of graffiti seems to discourage would-be graffiti artists from revisiting previously tagged sites?"

In response, Councillor Lynn advised:

"First and foremost I'm sorry that you found it necessary to take such action.

I have asked officers what they know about this issue in your ward and I have been told that there have been a couple of incidents of tagging on council property including Clay House Park. I believe you may have raised this issue at the recent Safer Cleaner Greener meeting and I thank you for doing so as this will allow the information to be shared with locality based council officers as well as the Police to increase vigilance.

In respect to the delay in removing the graffiti, without the detail I cannot give a specific response, but I do know that Green Spaces and Street Scene have had some operational capacity issues as they have unfortunately lost a number of experienced staff in this area of work. Recruitment to these vacant posts is underway and we fully intend to have the service back to full strength as soon as possible.

Officers are currently exploring the opportunity to provide graffiti removal to community groups and I see no reason why this cannot be extended to councillors should they wish to be included. The service's Volunteer Officer and Healthy Safety Officer are leading on this work and I will ask them to contact you."

**33 TO CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING MOTIONS UNDER COUNCIL PROCEDURE  
RULE 14:**

**(A) SUPPORTING PROPORTIONAL REPRESENTATION FOR UK GENERAL  
ELECTIONS**

It was moved by Councillor Baker,  
Seconded by Councillor Evans,

This Council notes that:

The First Past the Post (FPTP) electoral system originated when land-owning aristocrats dominated parliament and voting was restricted to property-owning men.

In Europe, only the UK and authoritarian Belarus still use the archaic, single-round FPTP system for general elections while Proportional Representation (PR)

is used to elect parliaments in more than 80 countries. Those countries tend to be more equal, freer, and greener.

PR ensures that all votes count, have equal value, and that seats won match the votes cast. Under PR, MPs and Parliaments better reflect the age, gender and protected characteristics of local communities and the nation.

MPs better reflecting their communities leads to improved decision-making, wider participation, and increased levels of ownership of decisions taken.

PR would also end minority rule. In 2019, 43.6% of the vote provided one party with 56.2% of the seats and 100% of the power. PR also prevents 'wrong winner' elections such as occurred in 1951 and February 1974.

PR is already used to elect the parliaments and assemblies of Scotland, Wales, and Northern Ireland and should be extended to elections to the Westminster parliament.

Council therefore resolves to request that the Chief Executive writes to the relevant minister in the Cabinet Office urging the bringing forward of legislation to enable Proportional Representation to be used for general elections.

The **Motion** on being put to the vote was not carried.

Councillors Taylor, Hey, Thompson, Fenton-Glynn, Barnes, Dacre, Rivron, Brundell, Leigh MBE, Courtney and T Swift MBE commented on the Motion.

## **(B) TACKLING THE COST OF LIVING CRISIS**

The Mayor advised that a Motion had been received from the Labour Group regarding Tackling the Cost of Living Crisis. The Mayor further advised that an amendment had been received from the Liberal Democrat Group which had been circulated to the full membership of the Council prior to Item 15. On receipt of the amendment the Labour Group, after due consideration, amended their original Motion to incorporate Liberal Democrat Group Amendment, and consent was sought to accept the revised Motion without debate.

The Mayor asked Councillor Cavanagh if both herself and Councillor Cairney were happy to propose and second the incorporation of the Liberal Democrat Amendment into the Labour Motion. Both Councillor Cavanagh and Councillor Cairney confirmed that they were happy to accept the Liberal Democrat Amendment.

After being put to the vote, the acceptance of the revised **Motion** was carried.

**RESOLVED** that:

This Council notes that:

- The residents of this country and this borough are facing a cost of living crisis with inflation increasing at the fastest rate for 40 years and food and fuel costs

spiralling. As a result many families are really struggling to make ends meet and face impossible choices between heating, eating and paying rent or council tax.

- Ofgem are predicting that the number of households facing fuel poverty could double to £12 million next year and the price of food is also soaring, with the average price of pasta up by more than 50% since April last year and 94% of adults reporting increased prices for their food shop.
- This is affecting the poorest families in our borough disproportionately. Peter Matejic, Deputy Director at the Joseph Rowntree Foundation said:  
“Rising prices are affecting all of us but for the UK’s poorest families there is no escape from soaring costs because so much of their income goes into the basics that everyone needs to take part in society. The symptoms of these astonishing price rises can be seen in the shops, and they can be seen in people rationing showers to once a week, giving up milk in their tea and eating cold meals to avoid using the oven.”
- 24.2% of children in Calderdale already live in poverty (Dataworks, anti-poverty dashboard), over 21 thousand people claim universal credit, including working people, and 13 thousand people in the borough are paid less than the living wage.
- The organisations which make up the strong voluntary and community sector in Calderdale have already been working hard to ensure that residents who need help the most can get support from the sector and the Council (such as food banks or financial advice), but they are now reporting that demand is outstripping their resources as a result of the cost of living crisis.

This Council welcomes:

- The work that the Council and its partners have done to support local people to manage their finances– see Money and Well-Being in Calderdale on the Council’s web site.
- The Never Hungry Again campaign with local organisations to ensure that children do not go hungry in holidays or at any time.
- The commitment to a Living Wage by the Council and other local employers.
- The forthcoming Scrutiny in a day session on the cost of living crisis.

This Council further notes that:

- Since 2010 the country has seen increased austerity measures such as the benefit cap, child benefit caps and a bedroom tax resulting in hardship for many families and pushing children into poverty.
- Calderdale Council has seen its revenue budget reduced by 40% since 2010 and that has inevitably reduced its ability to assist working people and others who are finding it difficult to make ends meet. The economic and financial impact of Covid has also had an effect on the Council’s resources and ability to support our residents when wages and welfare support fail to keep up with the cost of living.

This Council therefore resolves to ask the Chief Executive to write to the current Chancellor calling on him or her to:

- Use the benefits system to uprate benefits in line with inflation to ensure that nobody falls below an income that allows them to afford the basics for themselves and their family.
- Adopt a better targeted approach to support people hardest hit by the cost of living crisis.
- Immediately stop deducting benefits at unaffordable rates which further reduces already low levels of support to families creating a lower cap on total deductions allowable.
- Extend free school meal provision to all children classified as living in poverty but who do not meet the 'free school meals' criteria.
- Reverse the Conservative government's £20 cut to universal credit.
- Respond to the impact of the cost of living crisis by developing a set of mechanisms for support to protect children and the lowest income families from harm by recognising the urgency of this situation.

Additionally, this Council resolves to request Cabinet to urgently:

- (a) Review and improve the Council's Anti-Poverty Strategy in light of the experiences of the Covid-19 pandemic and the current cost of living crisis; and
- (b) Review the grant-funding provided by this Council to debt advice organisations, such as Noah's Ark, which provide much-needed assistance to those in need but who may not approach other, more formal, organisations.

Councillors Porritt, Wilkinson, Evans, Baker, Thompson, Dacre, Foster, Blagbrough, Holdsworth, Courtney, Lynn, Taylor, Durrans, Smith and Fazal commented on the Motion.

### **(C) SECURE OUR GREEN SPACES**

It was moved by Councillor Robinson,  
Seconded by Councillor Whittaker,

This Council notes:

Local authorities are responsible for removing unauthorised encampments on council land, with the police also having powers to remove unauthorised encampments. The cost of action by the Council will, naturally, be borne by taxpayers.

In recent months, the Council has had to deal with a number of unauthorised encampments. The unauthorised encampments have restricted the use of recreational areas and green spaces by residents.

This Council acknowledges:

- The Council's current aim is to remove unauthorised encampments from Council land quickly, whilst giving due consideration to the welfare of those encamped.

- A simple unopposed legal eviction of a small encampment will cost between one and three thousand pounds, and a large, resisted removal can incur larger costs.
- Illegal encampments can result in the loss of revenue for nearby facilities such as car parks and leisure centres.
- It is also true that illegal encampments in rural areas attract fly-tipping, estimated costs range from spending between £200 and £500 to remove abandoned vehicles and other rubbish after an eviction.
- There are potential revenue savings associated with introducing preventative measures to secure recreational areas and green spaces, and an invest-to-save approach may wish to be considered.

This Council thanks:

All officers who have worked tirelessly to remove unauthorised encampments, secure land, and remove left over waste and material, whilst ensuring the welfare of the unauthorised encampments is assessed and monitored.

The Council resolves:

To ask the Leader of the Council to explore available revenue streams and to write to the Mayor of West Yorkshire to request that monies are made available to introduce preventative measures against illegal encampments, as an invest-to-save approach.

To request that the Place Scrutiny Board undertakes a review of unauthorised encampments on public land, including a discussion on the following:

- The council's strategy on the removal of unauthorised encampments
- The use of preventative measures, including physical obstructions
- Communication with the public; and
- Facilitating a conversation with all stakeholders, including the police, to ensure joint working is maximised

It was moved as an **AMENDMENT** by Councillor Dacre,  
Seconded by Councillor Courtney,

This Council notes:

Local authorities are responsible for removing unauthorised encampments on council land, with the police also having powers to remove unauthorised encampments. The cost of action by the Council will, naturally, be borne by taxpayers.

In recent months, the Council has had to deal with a number of unauthorised encampments. The unauthorised encampments have restricted the use of recreational areas and green spaces by residents.

*Delete all from this point and replace with:*

This Council notes that:

**Wednesday, 27th July, 2022**

The government's overarching aim is to ensure fair and equal treatment for travellers, in a way that facilitates the traditional and nomadic way of life of travellers while respecting the interests of the settled community.

To help achieve this, the government's aims in respect of travellers' sites are:

- (a) that local planning authorities should make their own assessment of need for the purposes of planning;
- (b) to ensure that local planning authorities, working collaboratively, develop fair and effective strategies to meet need through the identification of land for sites;
- (c) to encourage local planning authorities to plan for sites over a reasonable timescale.

This Council also notes:

That Gypsies and Travellers are one of most disadvantaged and marginalised groups in our society, particularly when child deaths, educational outcomes and life expectancy are considered;

That unauthorised encampments can lead to loss of amenity for settled residents, to damage of property and to clean up and enforcement costs for the Council;

That unauthorised encampments can heighten community tensions;

In addition unauthorised encampments do not have the necessary public health provision, do not always provide safe space, or facilitate children attending school;

That the Council's own accommodation needs assessment dates from 2015 and is therefore out of date;

The Calderdale Draft Local Plan adopts a strategic approach to meeting Gypsy and Traveller needs and provides for a Development Plan Document to identify a possible authorised site.

This Motion therefore calls on Cabinet and Council to:

Bring forward a paper on Gypsy and Traveller Accommodation Needs Assessment at the earliest opportunity;

Explore all options for providing sites such as Negotiated Stopping Places and possible private provision;

Continue to provide Public Health and welfare support to unauthorised encampments, take timely enforcement action when required and clear waste promptly;

Take preventative measures when appropriate;

Seek ways to foster better relations between Gypsies and Travellers and settled residents;

Improve communication with residents regarding timescales;

Engage with Gypsies and Travellers to ensure any proposals for a site are relevant and improve their health and education outcomes.

The **AMENDMENT** with the replacement wording on being put to the vote was carried.

Councillors Blagbrough, Smith, Thompson, Cavanagh and Taylor commented on the Amended Motion.

**RESOLVED** that:

This Council notes:

Local authorities are responsible for removing unauthorised encampments on council land, with the police also having powers to remove unauthorised encampments. The cost of action by the Council will, naturally, be borne by taxpayers.

In recent months, the Council has had to deal with a number of unauthorised encampments. The unauthorised encampments have restricted the use of recreational areas and green spaces by residents.

This Council notes that:

The government's overarching aim is to ensure fair and equal treatment for travellers, in a way that facilitates the traditional and nomadic way of life of travellers while respecting the interests of the settled community.

To help achieve this, the government's aims in respect of travellers' sites are:

- (a) that local planning authorities should make their own assessment of need for the purposes of planning;
- (b) to ensure that local planning authorities, working collaboratively, develop fair and effective strategies to meet need through the identification of land for sites;
- (c) to encourage local planning authorities to plan for sites over a reasonable timescale.

This Council also notes:

That Gypsies and Travellers are one of most disadvantaged and marginalised groups in our society, particularly when child deaths, educational outcomes and life expectancy are considered;



That unauthorised encampments can lead to loss of amenity for settled residents, to damage of property and to clean up and enforcement costs for the Council;

That unauthorised encampments can heighten community tensions;

In addition unauthorised encampments do not have the necessary public health provision, do not always provide safe space, or facilitate children attending school;

That the Council's own accommodation needs assessment dates from 2015 and is therefore out of date;

The Calderdale Draft Local Plan adopts a strategic approach to meeting Gypsy and Traveller needs and provides for a Development Plan Document to identify a possible authorised site.

This Motion therefore calls on Cabinet and Council to:

Bring forward a paper on Gypsy and Traveller Accommodation Needs Assessment at the earliest opportunity;

Explore all options for providing sites such as Negotiated Stopping Places and possible private provision;

Continue to provide Public Health and welfare support to unauthorised encampments, take timely enforcement action when required and clear waste promptly;

Take preventative measures when appropriate;

Seek ways to foster better relations between Gypsies and Travellers and settled residents;

Improve communication with residents regarding timescales;

Engage with Gypsies and Travellers to ensure any proposals for a site are relevant and improve their health and education outcomes.

**34 COMMENTS ON THE WORK OF SCRUTINY BOARDS, PANELS AND COMMITTEES AND QUESTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE TO THE CHAIRS OF SCRUTINY BOARDS, PANELS AND COMMITTEES**

There were no questions to the Chairs of Scrutiny Boards, Panels and Committees or comments from Members.